



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



A MULTI-STAKEHOLDER APPROACH TO ADVANCING WOMEN'S LAND RIGHTS USING THE SDGS FRAMEWORK: EXPERIENCE FROM TANZANIA

Godfrey Massay

Land Tenure Specialist, Landesa, Tanzania

godfreym@landesa.org

**Paper prepared for presentation at the
“2019 WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY”
The World Bank - Washington DC, March 25-29, 2019**

Copyright 2019 by author(s). All rights reserved. Readers may make verbatim copies of this document for non-commercial purposes by any means, provided that this copyright notice appears on all such copies.



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



Abstract

The adoption of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in 2015 has inspired actors to use the SDGs to advance specific agendas of interest at the national and global level. The actors who are working on the land sector have, in the spirit of leaving no one behind, organized themselves in advocating for data collection on tenure security, land law reforms, reclassifications of indicators, as well as localization of the indicators in national development plans. In Tanzania, Landesa in collaboration with the Ministry responsible for Gender established a Multi-stakeholder Platform on Women's Land Rights in order to generate discussions and exchanges that encourage and support the government to take responsibility and to act more effectively and quickly to support women's land rights. This paper highlights the milestones and lessons one year on since the platform was created.

Key Words: SDGs, Women's Land Right, Tanzania, Multi-stakeholder Platform



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



INTRODUCTION

Since the Global Community adopted the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in 2015, different actors have used the SDGs to advance specific agendas of interest at the national and global level. The actors who are working on the land sector, have, in the spirit of leaving no one behind, organized themselves in advocating for data collection on tenure security, land law reforms, reclassifications of indicators, as well as localization of the indicators in national development plans.

In a major advancement from the predecessor Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), the SDGs recognize the importance of land and women's land rights. Out of 230 indicators, seven are related to land and three are related to women's land rights. The latter include SDG Indicator 1.4.2, naming the *“Proportion of total adult population with secure tenure rights to land, with legally recognized documentation and who perceive their rights to land as secure, by sex and by type of tenure.”* Two other indicators fall under goal five. SDG Indicator 5.a.1 provides for the *“Proportion of total agricultural population with ownership or secure rights over agricultural land, by sex; and share of women among owners or rights-bearers of agricultural land, by type of tenure.”* And SDG Indicator 5.a.2 calls for the *“Proportion of countries where the legal framework (including customary law) guarantees women's equal rights to land ownership and/or control of land.”* These three indicators have been used by the land community to advocate for secure land tenure for women at the global and country levels.

At the country level, the opportunities provided by the SDGs are huge, and demand a level of capacity that is likely to surpass, in many cases, what currently exists. For this reason, Landesa chose to engage in Tanzania by piloting replicable, scalable and sustainable models to convene and equip local stakeholders so that they can make the most of the advocacy and accountability opportunities provided by the 2030 agenda.

Thus, in May 2018, Landesa in collaboration with the Ministry responsible for Gender supported the establishment of a Multi-stakeholder platform on women's land rights and the SDGs. We intended to work through convening events that bring myriad government actors (including those responsible for the data generation) to the table, together with a network of civil society organizations who are fully aware of the agenda and equipped to leverage it.

Our aim with this country-level work is to generate discussions and exchanges that encourage and support the government to act more effectively and quickly to support women's land rights.



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



The purpose of this paper is to document the process that led to the formation of the multi-stakeholder platform, its composition, terms of reference, agreed upon issues, and achievements and challenges gathered in the platform's first year. The author argues that the multi-stakeholder approach is the best way to advance specific agendas at the country as well as the international level.

FORMATION OF MULTI-STAKEHOLDER PLATFORM

The process of forming a multi-stakeholder platform on women's land rights and SDGs was preceded by a scoping exercise of the players in the land sector and existing platforms working on land in Tanzania. This was important because we did not want to duplicate efforts or compete with existing initiatives. We found several platforms working on land, investments and land use plans but we decided to choose the one called "Gender Mainstreaming Macro Group" of the Ministry responsible for gender. Several factors informed our choice of this group:

First: Composition of the group. The group is made up of gender focal persons from almost all ministries and important agencies such as the Bureau of Statistics, representatives from civil society organization and UN Agencies such as UN-WOMEN and FAO. Moreover, Landesa is also a member and has supported the group on technical issues related to land. Although the composition of the group membership was very diverse, it has all the key organizations and institutions that are working on SDGs and women land rights.

Second: The leadership. This group is chaired by the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry responsible for gender. It is the only platform among those we assessed which is chaired by a Permanent Secretary. It is important to have a high-level decision-maker chair the group, as this makes it easier to implement matters deliberated by the group.

Third: Access to the broader decision makers. The Permanent Secretary of the Ministry is also a member of the platform of Permanent Secretaries, and is thus able to present key issues from the group to the platform of permanent secretaries. This is the highest level of decision making and day-to-day implementation authority of the government. It is an important platform with the ability to move decisions and agendas forward through government processes.



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



Fourth: Sustainability. As previously stated, this group already existed and will continue to exist. It is coordinated by a secretariat of the Gender Division of the Ministry. Our role was to make a case for the group to consider issues on women's land rights which were not previously given prominence by the group. We are assured that the group will continue existing even after the end of the one-year project that Landesa is implementing.

Fifth: Interest of the Ministry to hold it. There was an expressed interest of the Ministry to hold the group. The Ministry was willing to institutionalize the group which is important for sustainability purpose.

Given the diversity of the members and mandates of the group, we requested a small group/sub-committee of the Macro Group be formed to work specifically on the women's land rights. It is this small group which we call "a Multi-stakeholder Platform on Women's Land Rights."

COMPOSITION OF MULTI-STAKEHOLDER PLATFORM

From the Macro Group, we selected a few ministries, institutions, and organizations whose works have direct bearing with SDGs and women land rights. We also considered the mandates and the current initiatives that relate to the three women land rights SDG indicators when we selected the organizations. The following ministries/institutions and organizations were selected:

*The Ministry responsible for gender:*¹ this ministry is responsible for women, youth, children, elders and all gender-related issues. It also coordinates the mainstreaming of gender across sectors, ministries and projects which the Government of Tanzania is implementing. Moreover, it represents the Government of Tanzania in international treaty bodies on women's rights, such as the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) and the Commission on the Status of Women (CSW).

*Ministry of Lands:*² The SDGs require countries to collect and report data on ownership of land by sex.³ The Ministry of Lands is thus responsible for designing infrastructure which will facilitate expedient collection, analysis, and reporting of information regarding land ownership.

¹ Ministry of Health, Community Development, Gender, Elderly and Children

² Ministry of Lands, Housing and Human Settlement Development

³ Indicator 1.4.2



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



Moreover, there are many ongoing projects related to land formalizations which the Ministry is implementing (Massay, 2018).

Ministry of Finance and Planning: This is the umbrella ministry responsible for the localization of SDGs in the country's plans. The Ministry of Finance and Planning has developed the National Five Year Development Plan 2016/17 – 2020/21 (FYDP II), to align, to the extent possible, with the SDG indicators. A total of 282 indicators from the medium-term development plan have been proposed for national monitoring, which will establish the baseline to measure progress towards sustainable development (UN-Women, 2017). Of the 244 SDG indicators, 243 have been identified as potentially applicable to Tanzania.⁴ 163 indicators have already been mapped and 80 are unmapped. Of 163 mapped indicators, 88 are primary and 75 secondary (URT, 2017).

Ministry of Agriculture: Indicator 5.a.1 is specific to agricultural land and agricultural populations. The Ministry of Agriculture thus has an important role to play in obtaining needed information.

*Ministry responsible for Local Government:*⁵ Over 70% of Tanzanian people live in villages which are within the purview of the Local Government Administration. Seventy percent of the land mass is located in villages, and this is where agriculture is predominantly practiced. Therefore, this is a critical ministry.

Ministry responsible for Legal Affairs: Indicator 5.a.2 is on legal reforms which involve changes in the legal, policy and institutional frameworks. These are all within the mandates of the Ministry of Legal Affairs.

*National Bureau of Statistics (NBS):*⁶ The Bureau is responsible for conducting national surveys on different issues and sharing the results of the surveys with the government and general public for planning purposes. It is a key institution in localization of indicators and has a direct responsibility to work with Government in ensuring effective implementation and monitoring of the SDGs and the Five-year Development Plan. The director of the Bureau is also the co-chair of

⁴ Only indicator 13.a.1 under Tier III is considered not applicable to Tanzania.

⁵ President Office, Regional Administration and Local Government (PO-RALG)

⁶ <https://www.nbs.go.tz/>



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



the Inter Agency Expert Group on SDG indicators, a group with the mandate to develop and implement the global indicator framework for the Goals and targets of the 2030 Agenda.⁷

The Law Reform Commission: This institution has diverse responsibilities which include review of legislations and institutional frameworks. Like the Ministry of Legal Affairs, its work is relevant to the realization of SDG indicator 5.a.2.

Civil Society Organizations: Selected international and local organizations working on land, gender issues, women's land rights, and rights of pastoralists in Tanzania have joined the group. They include Oxfam, Care International, Tanzania Women Lawyers Association (TAWLA), Pastoral Women Council (PWC), Tanzania Land Alliance (TALA), Hakiardhi, Landesa, and Tanzania Gender Networking Program (TGNP-Mtandao).

UN Agencies: Due to their roles as custodian agencies for the indicators and their ongoing works in the country related to the SDG indicators, UN-WOMEN and FAO are members of the platform.

Each Ministry and government institution has two representatives and each organization (CSO) has one representative. This was an intentional decision made for sustainability and continuity of the platform. It was noted that most Government officials do not consistently attend meetings. So, having two people would curb the situation by having at least one of the two attend meetings.

MANDATES AND MODUS OPERANDI OF THE PLATFORM

To effectively discharge their roles, members of the platform convene once after every three months or on an ad hoc basis before the meeting of the Gender Mainstreaming Macro Working Group. This allows members to agree on the issues which will be presented to the Macro Group. While the Ministry responsible for gender remains the host, a Secretariat composed of Landesa and Ministry responsible for gender officials provides coordination support to the group. Similarly, the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry responsible for gender is the chair of all the meetings of the platform.

In addition, members of the platform commit to be guided by the following terms of reference: (1) Develop a specific strategy to achieve SDG targets on women's land rights; (2) support delivery of

⁷ <https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/iaeg-sdgs/>



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



commitments under the SDG targets on women's land rights; (3) assist in collection, analysis, monitoring, reporting and disseminations of data on SDG indicators related to land and women's land rights, as well as additional data that may be needed to achieve the SDG commitments; (4) develop the charter of the members and specific issues the group wants to work on; (5) report the progress of their work to the Gender Mainstreaming Macro Group of the Ministry of Gender; (6) create awareness of stakeholders on the SDGs and on the importance of women's land rights, as well as what role they can play on strengthening women's land rights; and (7) implement any other relevant assignment that will be directed to them by the Gender Mainstreaming Macro Working Group or other Fora.

ISSUES IDENTIFIED BY THE PLATFORM

A year strategy containing activities and issues which run from July 2018 to June 2019 was developed by the platform and approved by the Macro Group. Issues and activities were categorically developed to meet the target and indicators of the SDGs on women's land rights.

Some of the actions identified toward indicators are: Ministry of Lands needs to record sex in every document and need to report sex-disaggregated information; NBS needs to add questions on documentation to surveys as described in metadata (e.g Demographic and Health Survey (DHS) and Household Budget Survey (HBS) DHS); NBS needs to recognize PRIndex⁸ as a valid source of data on individual perceptions of land tenure security, NBS needs to involve members of the sub-committee in identifying additional data needs, developing questionnaires and methodologies for surveys, and monitoring and reporting of such data, and NBS needs to add questions on agricultural holding as described in the metadata.

Moreover, some of the agreed upon actions toward the targets include the following:

- Conduct two forums of permanent secretaries where issues of women's land rights will be presented, to give these issues prominence and urgency;

⁸ One of the most fundamental ways of understanding the strength of property rights is through citizens' perceptions of them. Yet perceptions of tenure security have never been collected at a global scale, obscuring a clear understanding of the magnitude and nature of citizens' experience, and preventing the issue of property rights from receiving the visibility and attention it deserves. The Global Property Rights Index, or PRIndex, seeks to address this gap. PRIndex is a joint initiative of ODI and Land Alliance, with primary funding from the UK Department for International Development (DFID) and Omidyar Network.



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



- Ensure that the budget speech of the Ministry of Lands of 2019/2020 will be based on sex-disaggregated data; e
- Ensure that the Annual Land Sector Review explicitly addresses women's land rights particularly on the context of SDGs;
- Ensure policy and programmatic coordination between and among the ministry of lands, Ministry of Agriculture, PO-RALG and NBS to improve women's land rights; and
- Provide input into the ongoing national land policy review and subsequent reforms of land related policies and laws.

ACHIEVEMENTS

Barely a year since the platform was formed, there are some notable achievements. Although these achievements are attributed to the work of the platform, the platform cannot claim sole ownership of the achievements. There are certainly other actors who have contributed to these notable milestones.

First: members' knowledge on women's land rights and SDGs enhanced. Landesa and NBS conducted two days of extensive trainings on the SDGs, women's land right, as well as the localization of the SDGs in Tanzania. This helped members to understand basic aspects of the contents and processes of the SDGs with particular focus on women's land rights and why women's land rights matters. Eventually, stakeholders also became aware on the role their institutions need to play in advancing women's land rights using the SDG framework.

Second: data on perception of tenure security are available. One of the key actions toward implementing the indicators, as identified by the platform, is that "NBS needs to recognize PRIndex as a valid source of data on perception at the individual level." This action item was realized beyond expectation. The NBS in collaboration with Global Land Alliance piloted PRIndex⁹, a tool used to collect perception of tenure security, in Tanzania. Tanzania is among three first countries to pilot PRIndex. Others are India and Colombia.¹⁰ Thus, PRIndex is the valid source of data in Tanzania. The platform is currently working with NBS to do further analysis of the data obtained from PRIndex.

⁹ <https://www.prindex.net/>

¹⁰ <https://www.prindex.net/reports/prindex-analytical-report-2017-findings-3-country-test-colombia-india-and-tanzania/>



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



Third: the Ministry of Lands committed to collect information on land tenure by sex. Through the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry responsible for Gender issues, the platform wrote an official letter to the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Lands to start collecting information of land ownership by sex. At the moment, due to pressure from donors, only two land formalizations projects¹¹ have the data on land ownership by sex. The Ministry has committed to start collecting, recording, and disseminating the data on land ownership by sex on a project-by-project basis as well as in a more systematic way.

Fourth: growing momentum and collaboration. There is sustained interest and momentum among members of the platform on women's land rights and SDGs. These issues are debated and discussed in every meeting of the platform and organizations such as Oxfam and Care are interested to support the platform after the end of its first year strategy. Moreover, the discussion has started within the platform to develop a three-year action plan which members can support and implement.

CHALLENGES

Two major challenges have been observed so far:

One: delays in convening the Platform. Given the busy schedule of the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry responsible for Gender issues, it has not been easy to convene the meetings of the sub-group as planned. Meetings have been delayed pending the availability of the Permanent Secretary who is the chair of the meeting. Efforts are being made to address this challenge, including having a senior official represent the Permanent Secretary.

Two: some members have not been attending the meetings. The expectation was that members from each ministry, institution and organization will consistently attend the meetings. However, the reality is that some have not attended and/or have been inconsistently represented. This has made it difficult for all members to have the same level of understanding and to move at the same pace on the key issues for which we are advocating. The secretariat is exploring a better and more effective way to address this challenge.

¹¹ Land Tenure Support Program (LTSP) and Land Tenure Assistance (LTA). See <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/dfid-supports-tanzania-land-tenure-support-programme-ltsp>



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



CONCLUSION

The author has discussed in this paper a concerted multi-stakeholder effort to advance women's land rights using the SDGs framework in Tanzania. This is a vivid example of practicing the very SDG mantra- "leave no one behind," as applies to women's land rights. After the first year, initial evidence indicates that this multi-stakeholder approach is a very promising model which can be replicated in other geographies. Equally so, more needs to be done to address the challenges in order to enhance benefits from this pilot approach.



Catalyzing Innovation

ANNUAL WORLD BANK CONFERENCE ON LAND AND POVERTY
WASHINGTON DC, MARCH 25-29, 2019



REFERENCE

UNWOMEN (2017) Women's Land Rights and Tenure Security in the Context of the SDGs: Situational Analysis. (Draft Report –September 2017).

URT (2017) Women's Land Rights and SDG in the Context of Localization. Power Point Presentation.

Massay, G (2018) Addressing Women's Land Rights Using the SDGs Framework: Experience from Tanzania. World Bank Annual Land and Poverty Conference. Washing DC.