

Exploring Participatory Prospective Analysis: A collaborative, scenario-based approach for analyzing and anticipating the consequences of tenure reform implementation

Nining Liswanti, Esther Mwangi, Tuti Herawati, Mani Ram Banjade
*Centre for International Forestry Research, Jalan CIFOR Situ Gede, Bogor Barat 16115,
Indonesia phone +62518622622, fax +6251 8622100*

The past decade has seen an increasing acceptance among policy makers and practitioners that collaboration, dialogue and consensus-building among multiple stakeholders with multiple interests is central to resolving seemingly intractable public policy problems by generating broad support for decisions and producing conditions for long-term sustainability. In tandem with this shift towards the recognition of the importance of collaborative approaches in public decision making has been a wave of reforms in the forestry sectors in Africa, Asia and Latin America that devolve rights and authority from centralized forestry agencies to subnational governments or even to local communities. Many of these reforms have provided greater legal recognition of customary and local authorities, indigenous territorial rights, and women's rights. But the implementation of these reforms has been uneven and has led to mixed results, in some cases even increasing the tenure insecurity of local communities. In Indonesia case, the Government of Indonesia has made a commitment to putting 12.7 million hectares of state-owned forestry land under community management. Implementation of this ambitious reform in forest rights was intended to engender active collaboration between state and non-state institutions. However, limited coordination in planning and implementation has been observed among stakeholders. Moreover, participation of local communities in forest tenure reform processes has been limited.

The Global Comparative Study (GCS) - Tenure project is initiated by CIFOR (Center for International Forestry Research), to understand the relationships between statutory and customary land tenure and how these relationships affect tenure security of forest dependent communities, including women and other marginalized groups. The differential success or failure of policy and institutional innovations will be analyzed to enhance secure tenure rights, as well as identify strategies that are likely to lead to desired outcomes.

This paper emphasized the use of PPA scenario-based approach to facilitate a negotiation process and to improve the relevance of the results in building consensus. Relevant stakeholders have identified including community representatives, forestry officials (and other relevant government officials), NGO representatives, academic, practitioners, private sector, etc. We conducted participatory multi-stakeholder meeting in Maluku and Lampung provinces of Indonesia to identify a range of tenure security scenarios and to elaborate a series of actions in response to the scenarios identified. In Indonesia (learning from other case study), this approach helped strengthening the capacity of stakeholders for joint analysis and problem-solving. One advantage of undergoing PPA is that this method allows for intense interaction among stakeholders, and helps developing a common understanding of the current situation and evolution of the problem and to begin the construction of collective agreements around resource management and planning.

This paper presents an analysis of the results and outcomes of PPA, which included key factors affecting forest reform implementation, a range of tenure security scenarios and the actions that multiple stakeholders identified to mitigate threats to local tenure security. Developing scenarios for future tenure security have considered various aspects including economic, social, political, environmental and cultural factors. The results are expected to help decision makers understanding the challenges and future consequences for exploring policy options that lead at more effective implementation practices of tenure reforms at local, regional, and national level.

This approach, which is increasingly being applied in different problem-solving arenas across diverse settings, seems to be a viable approach towards building consensus and enhancing collaborative governance of tenure. This study also shows that if facilitated properly, the PPA processes can be instrumental in strengthening capacity of the stakeholders for joint analysis and problem-solving, improving deliberation among stakeholders, and in enhancing their understanding of pathways to tenure security.

Keywords: scenario building, consensus, stakeholder participation, tenure security, forest tenure reform, foresight, collaborative governance, participatory prospective analysis