

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF DIFFERENT CARE DELIVERY MODELS IN A HOSPITAL SETTING ON PATIENT AND NURSE RELATED OUTCOMES: A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW

Background

Worldwide, countries are dealing with nursing shortages, cost containment in nursing care and an increasing need for health care [1]. Alternative ways of organizing nursing care could be of value. Therefore, the organization of nursing care with the use of care delivery models should be of renewed interest. The most commonly known nursing care delivery models are total patient care, functional nursing, team nursing and primary nursing [2].

Aim

The aim of this literature review was to synthesize the effectiveness of different care delivery models in a hospital setting on patient and nurse related outcomes.

Methods

A systematic literature review towards studies in which a quantitative comparison was made between different care delivery models was executed. The search string consisted of four clusters: care delivery models, nursing, ward/hospital setting and the research designs. Four electronic databases were searched, looking at studies published between 2000 and January 2023: Medline (Pubmed & Embase), CINAHL and Web of Science. Exclusion criteria were emergency departments, delivery rooms, psychiatry, outpatient clinics and military hospitals. Papers reported in English, French, German, Dutch or Italian were included in this review.

Results

In total, 22 studies were included in this systematic review. These studies reported mostly a comparison between two care delivery models. The care delivery models most frequently compared in studies were primary nursing, functional nursing and team nursing. Only one randomized controlled trial was found, other included studies were pretest-posttest, quasi-experimental or cross-sectional designs. Studies reported almost all different outcomes. Only job satisfaction, patient satisfaction and quality of nursing care were reported several times. Due to this high heterogeneity in outcome measures between the studies and limited significant findings, a meta-analysis or even only a comparison between the included studies was difficult to conduct.

Discussion

This systematic review found mixed evidence, inconsistent reporting, heterogeneity in outcome measures and lack of long-term effectiveness and thereby indicates a limited knowledge base on the most effective nursing care delivery model. This leads us to question the knowledge base on nursing care delivery models, although a knowledge base is needed to further develop nursing and to counter the future challenges.

Implications and future perspectives

This systematic review gave us, although limited, some insights on the effectiveness of care delivery models and policy options in hospitals. The development of a core outcome set could be beneficial to advance the field of research in care delivery models. In addition, a qualitative evidence synthesis could give us a better view on the factors influencing the implementation of different care delivery models.

References

1. Yatsu, H., & Saeki, A. (2022). Current trends in global nursing: A scoping review. *Nursing open*, 9(3), 1575-1588. <https://doi.org/10.1002/nop2.938>
2. Adams, A., Bond, S., & Hale, C. A. (1998). Nursing organizational practice and its relationship with other features of ward organization and job satisfaction. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 27(6), 1212-1222. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2648.1998.00657.x>